



ARTICLES

Musical creativity in the primary education curriculum in Spain and its educational implications

La creatividad musical en el currículo de Educación Primaria en España y sus implicaciones educativas

Luis del Barrio-Aranda¹

Departamento de Expresión Musical, Plástica y Corporal, Universidad de Zaragoza, Zaragoza (España)

Desirée García-Gil²

Departamento de Didáctica de las Lenguas, Artes y Educación Física, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, Madrid (España)

Laura Cuervo-Calvo³

Departamento de Didáctica de las Lenguas, Artes y Educación Física, Universidad Complutense de Madrid, Madrid (España)

doi:10.7203/LEEME.50.24120

Received: 07-07-2022 Revision: 11-08-2022 Acceptance: 28-11-2022

Abstract

The aim of this paper is to analyse the treatment of musical creativity in the Primary Education curriculum of the Spanish educational system as a basis for understanding the musical didactic orientation and the contribution to its education as a transversal competence. Following a documentary review methodology, this work analyses and compares creativity in the Primary Education music curricula of all the autonomous communities in the period 2014-2022. For the analysis of the data, a matrix of categories and subcategories of study is developed to investigate creativity in Arts Education, the methodology for its teaching and its evaluation. From the texts analysed, arise the belief that the teaching of musical creativity in Primary Education could contribute to the development of the autonomy, understanding and musical expression of pupils, and therefore, curricular documents should reinforce its treatment by providing greater concreteness and a meaningful relationship between the purpose, the methodological approach and the assessment that determine its education.

Key words: creativity; music education; Primary Education; curriculum research.

Resumen

El presente trabajo tiene como finalidad el análisis del tratamiento de la creatividad musical en el currículo de Educación Primaria del sistema educativo español como base para la comprensión de la orientación didáctica musical y la contribución a su educación como competencia transversal. Siguiendo una metodología de revisión documental, este trabajo analiza y compara la creatividad en los currículos musicales de Educación Primaria del conjunto de las comunidades autónomas en el período comprendido entre 2014-2022. Para el análisis de los datos, se elabora una matriz de categorías y subcategorías de estudio que investigan la creatividad en el área de Educación Artística, la metodología para su enseñanza y su evaluación. De los textos analizados, se induce la creencia de que la enseñanza de la creatividad musical en Educación Primaria podría ayudar en el desarrollo de la autonomía, la comprensión y la expresión musical del alumnado; de modo que, los documentos curriculares deberían reforzar su tratamiento dotando de una mayor concreción y relación significativa entre el propósito, el enfoque metodológico y la evaluación que determinan su educación

Palabras clave: creatividad; educación musical; Educación Primaria; investigación curricular.

¹ Profesor Ayudante Doctor, Facultad de Educación, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4732-4128>

* Contacto y correspondencia: Luis del Barrio Aranda, Departamento de Expresión Musical, Plástica y Corporal, Universidad de Zaragoza, delbarri@unizar.es, Pedro Cerbuna 12, C.P. 50009 Zaragoza. España.

² Profesora Contratada Doctora, Facultad de Educación, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0591-6873>

³ Profesora Contratada Doctora, Facultad de Educación, <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7577-202X>

1. Introduction

The orientation of educational systems to the demands of the 21st century underpins the interest in educational models based on critical thinking, proactivity and expression that make creativity education necessary as a means of access and development of knowledge from the methodology of learning by doing (Roberts, 2011; Weng *et al.*, 2022). Creativity constitutes a fundamental faculty for the development of human thought (Kaplan, 2019) and the evolution of society. This transversal capacity involves working on adaptive and entrepreneurial skills such as flexibility, commitment, responsibility, initiative, autonomy and innovation (Blanco & Peñalba, 2020; Ruíz-Herrero, 2013) in order to respond to the demands of society. Its education requires a reinterpretation of didactics with the integration of critical and creative thinking to ensure that its teaching and study can be applied to different cognitive domains (Fernández & Jorquera, 2017).

The concept of creativity as a mental aptitude associated with productive thinking has been studied from different dimensions. Originally, the first research carried out in the mid-20th century interpreted it from a humanistic dimension centred on the qualities of the creative person (Ausubel, 1963; Galton, 1869; Guilford, 1950; Wertheimer, 1959), while later studies are focused on the social and cultural dimensions, in turn based on the ability to create ideas and associations between concepts to find solutions to problems in order to transform and improve a field of study (Csikszentmihalyi, 1998; Esquivias, 1997; Marín & De la Torre, 1991; Mitjás, 1995; Sawyer, 2012; Torrance, 1976; Wollchslager, 1976). As a cognitive capacity, creative practice promotes the production and transformation of ideas into original and useful products, which requires knowledge or "mastery" of the field of study; it fosters an original mode of intervention that involves the development of creative thinking skills (synthetic, analytical and practical-contextual) (Sternberg, 1985) to imagine a range of possibilities for tackling the problem, an 'intrinsic motivation' that stimulates engagement in action just for the pleasure of doing it (Amabile, 1997) and formative evaluation (Fautley, 2010) from which to give greater meaning to learning in practice. Therefore, it is necessary to understand and take into account that creativity can be modulated by being determined by biological, psychological, social or environmental factors (Ward, 2007).

The International Bureau of Education (IBE-UNESCO), a centre of excellence in curriculum and education-related matters and collaboration with member countries in the improvement of their curricula, in its aim to focus the comprehensive education of students on autonomous education, includes creativity as a transversal adaptive and innovative competence in the search for and creation of solutions to problems (Merchán *et al.*, 2022; Stabback, 2016). In addition to this, other competences included are communication, collaboration, critical thinking, the ability to learn to learn, management and valuing diversity.

The curriculum, understood as "a regulated selection of the contents to be taught and learned, and of the didactic practice that is developed during schooling" (Gimeno, 2010, p.22), integrates creativity in the educational processes that relate subjects, culture and society, determining the pedagogical orientation and teaching intervention. The Spanish Organic Law of Education (Government of Spain, 2020) establishes that "the curriculum will be oriented to facilitate the educational development of students, guaranteeing their comprehensive education, preparing them for the full exercise of human rights, an active and democratic citizenship in today's society" (p.122883).

Creativity as a value that identifies active citizenship is a practice inherent to Arts Education that includes experimentation, expression and production. *Royal Decree 157/2022, which establishes the organisation and minimum teachings of Primary Education in Spain* (Government of Spain, 2022), relates the familiarisation of pupils with different forms of expression from individual and collective creative practice through the exploration of different artistic, musical, scenic and performative languages, the work of sound and body techniques for the creation of their productions and the use of tools, instruments and materials that promote the creative, community and social dimension of the area. According to Beghetto and Kaufman (2017), learning contexts in which to develop creativity must be facilitated, providing students with creative content, as well as programming teaching for the development of their creative skills.

The integration of creativity in the set of skills aimed at the comprehensive development of pupils is determined by the educational principles and methodological guidelines that the governments and educational administrations of each country include in their curricula. In the field of music, creativity in primary education occupies a prominent place in the curricula of countries such as Australia (ACARA, 2021), Finland (Finnish National Agency for Education, 2020) and the United Kingdom (Department for Education, 2014). In addition, the National Coalition for Core Arts Standards (NCCAS, 2014) in the United States structures music standards with an organisation that follows the artistic processes of creating (imagining, planning and making, evaluating and refining and presenting); performing (selecting, analysing, interpreting, revising, evaluating and refining and presenting) responding (selecting, analysing, interpreting and evaluating) and connecting (synthesising personal knowledge and experience to make music) (National Association for Music Education, 2014, 2017; NCCAS, 2013; Shuler, 2014). In the case of Ibero-America, the Early Childhood Education curricula with the most mentions of creativity are those of Mexico, Guatemala, Chile and Nicaragua. The results of this study point to the need for more teacher training in teaching methodologies to implement creativity in the classroom (Oliver *et al.*, 2022). In Hong Kong, music learning in Early Childhood Education is integrated into the 'Arts and Creativity' curriculum and comprises the learning of (1) developing sensory skills and accumulating artistic experiences, (2) expressing emotions and developing creativity through artistic creations, and (3) developing creativity through exploration and management (Ho & Bautista, 2022). In all these curricula, objectives and content related to improvisation and composition are included. But what is the research interest that motivates this study of musical creativity education in Primary Education? Creative education seeks an understanding of music as an aural art that prepares students for an autonomous musical education based on the experience of making music that encompasses the work of aural, interpretative and creative skills.

The development of a research stay motivates this study on the legislative analysis of musical creativity in Primary Education, taking the following factors as a starting point: the absence of research on musical creativity in the legislative framework of basic curriculum education (Hart, 2019; Odena, 2005), the study of the contribution of music education to the development of creativity as an emancipatory capacity (Burnard & Murphy, 2017; Odena & Welch, 2009) and the contribution to a growing trend of research in music education on disciplines that relate education, person and society (Bouji, 2004; Burnard, 2012; Hallam, 2010; Haning, 2020).

These reasons promote the drafting of the following research questions in our study: what presence does creativity have in the Primary Education curriculum in Spain? What educational approach does creativity acquire in the regional curricula? How does creativity in music education take shape in the different regional curricula?

1.1 Objectives

The purpose of this research is to analyse the treatment of musical creativity in the Primary Education curriculum of the Spanish educational system as a basis for didactic orientation and contribution to the education of creativity as a transversal competence. As for the specific objectives:

- To study the educational approach that identifies creativity in the musical curriculum of Primary Education.
- To analyse creativity as an objective of study and its evaluation according to the different creative modalities.
- To examine in a contrasted manner, the methodological orientations that include the application of creativity in musical learning in the different regional curricula.

2. Method

This study uses a qualitative methodology of documentary and comparative review (Caballero *et al.*, 2016; Rapley, 2014).

2.1. Design

Its design is based on a research of printed documentary sources based on the "search, retrieval, analysis, critique and interpretation" (Arias, 2012, p.158; Guest *et al.*, 2012; Xu and Zammit, 2020) of the results extracted from the review and comparison of the objectives, contents, evaluation criteria, competences and methodological orientations related to creativity in the music curricula of Primary Education in all the autonomous communities of Spain in the period 2014-2022.

2.2. Context

The curricular framework of Primary Education constitutes the context of study for the analysis of musical creativity in the regional curricula. The analysis of the data requires a synthesis and organisation of the information, the interpretation of which makes it possible to respond to the research objectives.

2.3. Sample

The sample under study is made up of the 18 regional music education curricula in Primary Education that make up the Spanish education system.

2.4. Categories

For data analysis, a thematic approach is carried out with the aim of coding qualitative information focused on identifying and describing implicit and explicit ideas within the data and/or themes (Boyatzis, 1998; Guest *et al.*, 2012). Consequently, this type of analysis allowed themes to be converted into categories providing a pattern of data recognition (Fereday & Muir-Cochrane, 2006).

The elaboration of this aprioristic categorical system is approached from the grounded theories of musical creativity in the subject Art Education in Primary Education and the educational contextualisation of its treatment and assessment according to the following categories: creativity in the definition of Art Education, musical creativity as a study objective, creativity assessment and methodological orientations (Alsina, 2006; Glăveanu, 2018; Martínez *et al.*, 2019).

The research objectives were taken into account to determine whether the findings were in relation to these: relevant units transformed into meanings were categorised into common themes. The subcategories that emerged within the categories made it possible to concretise and outline the understanding of the didactic treatment of musical creativity in the different curricula in a specific and comparative way (Table 1).

Table 1. System of study categories and subcategories

Subject of study	Categories	Subcategories
Education of musical creativity	1. Creativity in the definition of Arts Education	Presence of creativity Educational approach to creativity
	2. Musical creativity as an objective of study	Contextualisation in the objectives of Art Education Creative modalities and their application in the cycles and means of expression
	3. The evaluation of creativity	Integration of musical creativity in curricular assessment Typology of assessed learning (knowledge, skills and attitudes) Basic creative knowledge
	4. Methodological guidelines	Didactic strategies

2.5. Instrument

Manual coding of the data is carried out on the basis of the information extracted from the legislative documentary review. A matrix of categories and subcategories is constructed to frame the specific and comparative analysis of creativity in the autonomous curricula.

The methodological rigour of this qualitative research takes into account compliance with the criteria of credibility, reliability, confirmability and transferability (Baskale, 2016). To this end, data collection, the selection of the unit of analysis, the creation of codes and categories and their interpretation in line with the proposed research objectives were carried out.

2.6. Procedure

The procedure followed consisted of the following phases:

- A. Review of the current regulations governing arts education in national and regional primary education curricula.
- B. Analysis of musical creativity in the general aspects of the area of Arts Education, the objectives, contents, assessment criteria, assessable learning standards, specific competences, basic knowledge and methodological guidelines. An ad hoc analysis table is used for data collection.
- C. Relation of information between curricula for the establishment of the categorisation of the study as a basis for comparative analysis.

3. Results

The results obtained and their corresponding analysis are presented according to the category system of the study (Table 1).

3.1. Creativity in the definition of Arts Education

Royal Decree 126/2014, of 28 February, which establishes the basic curriculum for Primary Education includes in Annex II (specific subjects) the need for Arts Education for the development of human beings as a "means of expression of their ideas, thoughts and feelings" (Government of Spain, 2014, p.45). Consequently, the aim is for pupils to "understand, know and investigate from an early age the fundamentals of these languages for the development of attention, perception, intelligence, memory, imagination and creativity" (p.45). In this sense, creativity aims to stimulate pupils' autonomy and expressive capacity by working on skills and techniques in different languages in which to project their expressive, communicative and artistic dimension.

Educational presence and approach

The presence of creativity in the area of Arts Education is analysed, in this study, in the definition of the area in the regional curricula. For the analysis of curricular presence, a dichotomous nominal scale is used. Subsequently, the approach attributed by each community to Arts Education allows us to differentiate between the following approaches: creative, expressive, cultural and philosophical (Table 2).

Table 2. Creativity in the definition of Arts Education in the regional curricula

Communities	Presence	Creative approach	Expressive approach	Cultural approach	Philosophical approach
Andalucía	Yes	x			
Aragón	Yes	x			
Asturias	Yes	x			
Baleares	Yes			x	
Canarias	Yes	x			
Cantabria	Yes		x		
Castilla La Mancha	Yes			x	
Castilla y León	Yes		x		
Cataluña	Yes				x
Extremadura	Yes		x		
Galicia	Yes	x			
Madrid	Yes		x		
Murcia	Yes		x		
Navarra	Yes		x		
País Vasco	Yes		x		
La Rioja	Yes	x			
Valencia	Yes	x			
Ceuta y Melilla	Yes		x		

Creativity is present in the definition of Arts Education in all the Autonomous Communities. Of the 18 Autonomous Communities, seven of them (38.8%), Andalusia, Aragon, Asturias, the Canary Islands, Galicia, La Rioja and Valencia, define Arts Education from a creative and aesthetic approach, guiding pupils to discover and make their own artistic creations. For their part, eight communities (44.4%), Cantabria, Castilla y León, Extremadura, Madrid, Murcia, Navarra, the Basque Country, Ceuta and Melilla, interpret it from an expressive approach by understanding it as a "means of expression of ideas, thoughts and feelings" according to the terms used in the state curriculum (*Royal Decree 126/2014*, p.45), two communities (11.11%) (Baleares and Castilla La Mancha) understand it from an active and cultural approach to appreciate and enjoy art and only the community of Catalonia (5.55%) interprets it from a cognitive philosophical approach as a discipline that favours the structure of students' thinking and helps them to understand, distinguish, think and construct knowledge. The approach and concreteness that each community gives to the definition of creativity describes the nature of its understanding and establishes the frame of reference for the orientation of its didactics.

3.2. Musical creativity as an objective of study

This category includes, on the one hand, the analysis of the contextualisation of creativity in the objectives of Art Education and, on the other hand, its concretion and work according to the different creative modalities and its application in the different cycles of Primary Education and means of expression.

Contextualisation in the objectives of Arts Education

The education of creativity as an educational purpose leads to the analysis of the objectives of the area of Art Education in Primary Education, as established by *Royal Decree 1513/2006, of 7 December, which establishes the minimum teachings of Primary Education* (Government of Spain, 2006) that integrate the development of the skills to be worked on at this

stage. Of the 9 objectives of the area, musical creativity is integrated in 6 of them. Its interpretation implies education in actions such as: "to investigate the possibilities of sound and use them for the expression of ideas" (Objective 1, O1); "to explore and learn about materials and instruments and use them for expressive and communicative purposes" (O2); "to learn about the possibilities of audiovisual media and ICT and use them to create their own productions" (O5) and "to produce artistic productions in a cooperative way, collaborating in the resolution of problems to achieve a satisfactory final product" (O8) (p.36). Likewise, their work integrates the education of creative behaviour that leads to "maintaining an attitude of search, imagination, enquiry and sensitivity to enjoy artistic productions" (O4) and of autonomy from which "to develop a relationship of self-confidence with personal artistic production and respect for one's own and others' creations" (O7) (p.36).

Creative modalities and their application in the cycles and means of expression

Musical creativity can be worked on according to the modalities: elaboration of arrangements, improvisation and composition. Each community introduces the work of these modalities in the means of vocal (V), instrumental (I) and corporal (C) expression with different activities in the cycles (1st, 2nd and 3rd) of Primary Education according to the following Table 3:

Table 3. Creative modalities and their contextualisation according to the means of expression

Communities	Arrangements			Improvisation			Composition		
	1st	2nd	3rd	1st	2nd	3rd	1st	2nd	3rd
	Cycle	Cycle	Cycle	Cycle	Cycle	Cycle	Cycle	Cycle	Cycle
Andalucía	C				V	VI		C	VIC
Aragón	C			C	VC	VIC		C	VIC
Asturias	I	IC			V			C	VIC
Baleares	C	I			C			C	IC
Canarias	C			VC				C	VIC
Cantabria	C			C	VC			VC	VIC
Castilla La Mancha	VIC				VC	VIC			VIC
Castilla y León	C	I			VIC	V		IC	VIC
Cataluña	IC			VC	VC	VC		VC	VIC
Extremadura	IC				C	VIC		C	VIC
Galicia	IC		I	VC	I	IC		IC	VIC
Madrid	C	I		IC		VIC		IC	VIC
Murcia	IC	IC		C	VI				IC
Navarra	C	I	I	V	VI	IC			IC
País Vasco	IC	I		VC	VIC	VIC		IC	VIC
La Rioja	IC				V				VIC
Valencia	IC			C	VIC	VI		C	VIC
Ceuta y Melilla	IC			C	V				VIC

Vocal (V), Instrumental (I) and Corporal (C) means of expression

The elaboration of arrangements is mainly worked on in the first cycle. Sound exploration in body percussion is worked on in all communities and exploration with sound materials and instruments in ten communities (55.5%). The creation of rhythmic accompaniments to texts or songs is also introduced as activities that introduce creative practice.

Improvisation, understood as a modality of making music at the moment, begins in the first cycle in ten communities (55.5%) in the corporal medium and in four communities (22.2%) in the vocal medium, based on exploration, free expression, expression of feelings and symbolic play. In the second cycle, vocal improvisation is worked on in thirteen communities (72.2%), corporal improvisation in nine (50%) and instrumental improvisation in six (33.3%). In the third cycle, half of the communities' work on improvisation in different means of expression. Vocal improvisation in the last two cycles is associated with question-answer exercises and small free improvisations, while instrumental improvisation is improvised in the pentatonic and diatonic scale, which requires a more elaborate level of musical construction.

Composition as the most complex, reflected and elaborated creative modality requires the invention, arrangement and recording of ideas (Del Barrio-Aranda, 2012). Its curricular practice is reserved for the second and third cycles. In the second cycle, body composition is applied in thirteen communities (72.2%) and refers to the creation of choreographies. Instrumental composition is worked on in four communities (22.2%) and vocal composition in two (11.1%). In the third cycle, composition is applied in the three means of vocal, instrumental and corporal expression in fifteen communities (83.3%). Composition activities take the form of musical artistic projects involving the work of all the means of expression, the invention of choreographies in the corporal area, the composition of songs and the use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) for the instrumental composition of simple musical pieces.

3.3. The assessment of musical creativity

Although Royal Decree 984/2021 on assessment and promotion in Primary Education (Government of Spain, 2021) establishes the general measures of assessment and promotion for the first, third and fifth grades in the academic year 2022/23 and second, fourth and sixth grades in the academic year 2023/24 (p.141586), the assessment of Music Education is currently governed by Royal Decree 126/2014 (Government of Spain, 2021) which establishes the basic curriculum of Primary Education and the assessment of creativity is integrated in the criteria and standards indicated in the three blocks: 1. Listening, 2. Music performance and 3. Music, movement and dance (p.46) (Table 4).

Integration of musical creativity in curricular assessment

The analysis of the curricular regulations allows us to identify creativity in 85.7% of the assessment criteria for Music Education, as it is included in 6 of the 7 criteria.

Table 4. Integration of musical creativity in assessment

Evaluation criteria	Assessable learning standards
Block 1. Listening	
1. Use listening to music to investigate the possibilities of sound as a frame of reference for their own creations	
2. Analyse the organisation of simple musical works and describe the elements of which they are composed	2.2. Is interested in discovering musical works of different characteristics, and uses them as a frame of reference for his/her own creations
Block 2. Musical performance	
1. To understand the voice as an instrument and expressive resource, starting from the song and its possibilities for interpreting, creating and improvising	1.1. Recognises and describes the qualities of the voice through a variety of auditions and recreates them
2. Perform alone or in a group, using voice or instruments, using musical language, simple compositions containing musical procedures of repetition, variation and contrast, assuming responsibility in group performance and respecting the contributions of others as well as the person who assumes the direction	
3. Explore and use the sound and expressive possibilities of different materials, instruments and electronic devices	3.2. Uses audiovisual media and computer resources to create musical pieces and for the soundtrack of images and dramatic representations
Block 3. Music, movement and dance	
1. Acquire expressive and creative skills offered by corporal expression and dance, valuing their contribution to heritage and enjoying their interpretation as a form of social interaction	1.1. Identifies the body as an instrument for the expression of feelings and emotions and as a form of social interaction
	1.5. Invent choreographies that correspond to the internal form of a musical work and involve a spatial and temporal order

In Block 1, listening is evaluated as a means of sound exploration oriented towards the elaboration of one's own productions. Block 2 assesses the ability to recognise and use vocal and instrumental possibilities, materials, audiovisual media and technological resources applied to the creation of musical pieces. Block 3 evaluates the expressive and creative capacities integrated in the corporal knowledge for the expression of feelings and the invention of choreographies as a means of analysis of the musical form (Table 4).

Types of learning assessed: knowledge, skills and attitudes

The typology of creative learning assessed in the assessment criteria of Royal Decree 126/2014 establishing the Primary Education curriculum (Government of Spain, 2014) allows us to differentiate between knowledge, skills and attitudes (Table 5).

Table 5. Types of learning assessed: knowledge, skills and attitudes

Content Blocks	Knowledge	Skills	Attitudes
1. Listen	Analytical thinking	Identify, classify and describe	Interest in the search for authorship
2. Musical interpretation	Practical thinking, creative thinking	Interpret Create Improvise	
3. Music, movement and dance	Practical thinking, creative thinking	Interpret Create Improvise	Enjoy

"Listening" evaluates the analytical ability to identify, classify and describe the qualities of sound in the natural and social environment using a precise vocabulary as a basis for its integration in the elaboration of their own creations, as well as interest in the search for musical works, the use of characteristics incorporated in their own creations and respect for the authorship of the works. In "Block 2. Musical performance", the ability to perform, create and improvise with the voice, instruments, materials and electronic devices, the creation of pieces, the sonorisation of images and dramatic representations is assessed. Attitudes associated with vocal and instrumental performance and creation are not assessed. "Music, movement and dance" assesses the ability to perform, create and improvise productions and choreographies and to enjoy individual and group performance as a form of emotional expression and social interaction.

The assessment criteria of the state curriculum include the assessable learning at the end of the stage and serve as a reference for the regional curricula for the planning of their breakdown and sequencing throughout the Primary Education courses.

Basic creative skills

The analysis of the basic knowledge that pupils must work on during the stage will allow us to know the concreteness of the didactics of creativity through assessment, in accordance with *Royal Decree 157/2022, of 1 March, which establishes the organisation and minimum teaching of Primary Education* (Government of Spain, 2002) in its section "Basic knowledge". The basic knowledge related to musical creativity in the subject Artistic Education (p.46) is part of the blocks: B. Creation and Performance and D. Music and Performing and Scenic Arts (Table 6).

Table 6. Basic knowledge related to creativity

B. Creation and Interpretation			
	1st cycle	2nd cycle	3rd cycle
Phases of the creative process	Guided planning and experimentation	Planning, interpreting and experimenting	Planning, interpretation, experimentation and evaluation
Interest	By process and end product	By process and end product	Interest in and evaluation of the process and final product. Respect. Plagiarism and copyright
D. Music and Performing and Performing Arts			

Instrumental, vocal and corporal practice	Experimentation, creative exploration and interpretation	Experimentation, creative exploration, interpretation and guided improvisation	Experimentation, creative exploration, interpretation, improvisation and autonomous composition
Instrument construction			Experimentation, creative exploration, interpretation, improvisation and autonomous composition
Application of musical language concepts		Performance, vocal and instrumental improvisation	Performance, vocal and instrumental improvisation
Basic computer applications		Recording and editing audio: use in audition	Recording, editing audio and scores: use in listening, recording, playing, improvisation and creation of works
The body and its possibilities		Motor and creative: interest in experimentation and exploration with movement, dance, drama and theatre performance	Motor and creative: interest in experimentation and exploration with movement, dance, drama and theatre performance
Corporal techniques		Drama and dance Guided body improvisation	Drama and dance Guided and creative improvisation
Body capacities	Basic expressive and creative skills of corporal and dramatic expression	Expressive and creative techniques commonly used in body language and drama	Expressive and creative body language and drama

The evolution of basic knowledge related to musical creativity is continuous and cumulative and integrates a higher level of complexity and autonomy throughout the stage. With regard to the creative process, students in the 1st cycle are familiar with the phases of guided planning and experimentation, to which performance (2nd cycle) and evaluation (3rd cycle) are incorporated as a means of promoting critical thinking. Along these lines, students must demonstrate an interest in the process and the final creative product and, at the end of the stage, an ability to evaluate, respect diversity, authorship and the use of creative products (3rd cycle).

The creative modalities in instrumental, vocal and corporal practice include exploration and interpretation (1st cycle), improvisation (2nd cycle) and composition (3rd cycle). The application of musical concepts follows the same creative modalities. The knowledge and application of computer tools in musical creation and recording comprises the use of audio recording and editing tools (2nd cycle), completed with score editing, production, composition and recording (3rd cycle).

Bodily knowledge and its creative development comprises the work of experimentation and exploration in the various forms of expression of movement, corporal expression, dance and dramatization. The application of creative body-dramatic and dance techniques is the basis for guided improvisation (2nd cycle) and creative improvisation (3rd cycle). The expressive and creative body skills are developed throughout the stage integrated in body expression associated with movement, dance and dramatic expression.

3.4. Methodological guidelines

Methodological guidelines integrate the set of curricular guidelines that provide pedagogical reference information and didactic guidance for teaching intervention in the classroom.

Methodological orientations and didactic strategies for musical creativity

A comparative analysis of the treatment of musical creativity is shown in the study of the section on methodological guidelines of all the regional curricula. A manual coding is carried out and the following categorisation is obtained: active participation in the production of their works, the use of different musical codes, the teaching of creativity, active methodologies, learning by discovery, cooperative learning, the global artistic project and the integration of ICT in creative musical learning.

Table 7. Methodological orientations and didactic strategies for musical creativity

	Parti. active prod.	Various codes	Didacti. creati.	Active methods	Discov. learning	Coop. learning	Global project	TIC
Andalucía	x			x	x	x		
Aragón	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Asturias	x	x	x	x	x	x		x
Baleares	x				x	x	x	x
Canarias	x	x		x	x	x	x	
Cantabria	x		x		x	x		x
Castilla La Mancha	x			x	x	x		x
Castilla y León	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Cataluña	x	x		x	x	x	x	x
Extremadura	x			x				x
Galicia	x	x	x	x		x	x	x
Madrid	x			x				
Murcia	x	x		x	x	x	x	x
Navarra	x							x
País Vasco	x							
La Rioja	x							
Valencia	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Ceuta y Melilla	x							x

The analysis of the Royal Decrees that establish and regulate the implementation and development of Primary Education curricula in the Autonomous Communities reveals that the curricula of seven communities (38.8%) lack the section "Methodological guidelines", a heading that specifies the pedagogical principles and the lines of action of the areas affecting Art Education, music education and creativity.

In music education, active participation that integrates creativity to improve understanding of musical learning is recognised in all curricula. For their part, active methodologies are valued in twelve communities (66.6%) as a way of approaching music teaching through experience and creativity. Discovery learning is recognised in the curricula of eleven communities (61.1%). This strategy integrates musical exploration and creativity and allows for individual and autonomous learning. Cooperative learning, recognised by twelve communities (66.6%), is a creative group strategy that involves working on personal and social skills in the joint construction of knowledge. The development of global projects, recognised in the curricula

of eight communities (44.4%), promotes interdisciplinary artistic knowledge and the integration of learning in original productions. This didactic strategy favours the creative and transversal dimension of musical and artistic learning and broadens the scope of the contributions of music in transdisciplinary educational projects.

With regard to recording and production resources, information and communication technologies (ICT) are established as one of the basic didactic tools for the education of musical creativity, valued by thirteen communities (72.2%). It is certainly a support that facilitates recording, recording and editing. However, the didactics of creativity must not renounce the creative analogue modes of study and experimentation in the body of sound where to undertake the action and modulation of sound vibration for the understanding of expressive possibilities. With regard to musical representation, only eight communities (44.4%) consider the use of different codes as alternative notations that make it possible to collect musical characteristics or parameters. This strategy favours the individual's musical creative and expressive freedom, as the recording and representation of musical ideas is not conditioned by the mastery of a specific code.

To conclude, although musical creativity shows a generalised presence in the curricula as a whole, the didactics of creativity as a way of guiding the understanding of the progression in the work of creativity and musical production is recognised in six communities (33.3%). Therefore, creativity education needs a concrete didactic approach for the understanding and achievement of curricular objectives and associated skills.

4. Discussion

Creativity as an educational principle of creative theories stimulates the support of instruction, the evolution of teaching understanding and learning design (Kaplan, 2019, Weng *et al.*, 2022) as factors in continuous questioning and progress. Therefore, promoting creativity education from an anthropological dimension requires placing the person at the centre of pedagogical reflection and guiding a human being project that involves the growth of its dimensions: intellectual, social and moral (Azqueta & Naval, 2019). As has been pointed out in the introduction to this study, this will be reflected, among others, in commitment, responsibility and initiative (Blanco & Peñalba, 2020). The competence-based education model (OECD, 2019), in its aim to understand the way in which students learn and teachers teach, as an essential part of quality education policy, reinforces a position of learning development in the triangulation of knowing, doing and being, placing students as the main protagonist of the educational process. The review of the study shows that of the eight basic competences established in the Primary Education curriculum (Government of Spain, 2020), half of them - personal, social and learning to learn competence, initiative, entrepreneurship and cultural awareness and expression - involve working on creativity. The concretisation of music education in Cultural Competence and Expression (CCEC) allows for the recognition of creativity in the operational descriptors (CCEC3) which designate that students should express ideas, opinions, feelings and emotions in a creative way using different artistic and cultural languages by the end of Primary Education, and (CCEC4) to experiment creatively with different media, supports and plastic, visual, audiovisual, sound or body techniques in the elaboration of artistic and cultural proposals, which at the same time, is in line with international organisations already mentioned such as OINE-UNESCO (Merchán *et al.*, 2022). In accordance with what is set out in this text and with the assessments of Rodríguez-Quiles (2021) and Beghetto and Kaufman (2017), it would be advisable

to place the presence of creativity at the centre of curricular analysis in governmental orders, as it acquires a vitally important role in the continuation of lifelong learning, by seeking, among others, the adjustment of responsibility and self-management, considered to be 21st century skills and competences.

In music education, creativity brings students closer to music and its understanding through the experience of "doing" for the development of expression (Delalande, 2013), which integrates the work of aural, interpretative and creative skills. Some studies demonstrate the efficiency of creative musical learning by concluding that students who create their own music achieve their curricular objectives to a greater extent (Martinović-Bogojević & Rotar-Pance, 2022; Burnard & Murphy, 2017). Therefore, in addition to the assessment of musical knowledge, skills and creative attitudes, the curriculum should include an assessment of metacognitive strategies (Fautley, 2010), which allows us to analyse the ways students use to develop their learning and improve their creative thinking in order to guide their education.

Going deeper into the ideas of the beginning of the study in which contexts outside our borders were taken into account, international research on creative music education suggests that Primary Education teachers do not adequately stimulate the development of creativity (Ángel-Alvarado, 2018), even when they consider that it favours the improvement of learning skills in pupils (Saetre, 2011), so basic training in this sense is still necessary (Oliver *et al.*, 2022; Odena, 2005). In this way, teachers find it difficult to adjust the demands of the curriculum to their daily planning, also assuming that government requirements do not include the child in his or her uniqueness, but are designed for a more or less homogeneous group. The literature review indicates that any initiative in learning through creativity must start first of all from the teacher (Beghetto & Kaufman, 2017; Bylica & Bauman, 2022) and his or her interest and interpretation of creation as a way of understanding and personal musical expression implemented in didactics (Burnard, 2012). Music education teachers must contribute to students' creativity and provide them with learning opportunities with original, practical, creative and useful experiences (Abramo & Reynolds, 2015) in different disciplines in which to develop knowledge and work on new skills from productivity and entrepreneurship (Azqueta & Naval, 2019). This educational orientation towards entrepreneurship implies a personal attitude to take risks, a willingness to overcome obstacles and an opportunity to work on perseverance (Renzulli & Reis, 2014; Tomlinson *et al.*, 2009). As an entrepreneurial experience, creative practice involves work in a triple dimension: intellectual, with the involvement of creative cognitive processes; social, with the stimulation of communication, expression and aesthetics, associated with creative artistic activity; and moral, which, both in the creative process and its interpretation, harbours values such as respect for individuality, equality, solidarity and cooperation. Its study in the legislative framework allows us to understand the relationship and contribution of creativity to the education of these dimensions.

In general, the aim of each subject should be to increase students' knowledge, but this is no longer sufficient for future success, as students need creativity to apply this knowledge to solve everyday life situations and a wide range of complex problems to recognise their usefulness and significance (Corbisiero-Drakos *et al.*, 2021). Primary education is a crucial age to inspire the necessary innovation processes, both academic and personal, of the whole student body as a field of study, whose object of research relates creativity to innovation (Alhothali, 2021; Cinque, 2016). In the field of music education, it is possible to connect the creative use of information technology

with musical practice through digitised instruments, web design, music publishing, animation, video games and audiovisual productions (García-Gil *et al.*, 2022).

In this sense, teachers who integrate creativity and innovation in their methodology involve the work of psychoeducational processes while stimulating a positive correlation with the creative capacity of students (Berbel *et al.*, 2020; Coulson & Burke, 2013; Yi *et al.*, 2015). This generative and communicative skill of creative practice (De la Torre, 1991) involves and relates the development of cognitive processes of thinking, devising, organising and expressing ideas in the elaboration of original products. The integration of creativity in the classroom (Yelo Cano, 2018) requires teachers to provide an open, practical and co-educational learning environment with active participatory didactic guidance and orientation (Sawyer, 2012). Its didactic approach aims to stimulate flexible processes that promote experimentation, ambiguity and failure (Abramo & Reynolds, 2015) as elements of learning, as well as the search for balance between creative and disciplinary skills (Sawyer, 2017) in experiences that combine mastery and initiative, knowledge and innovation with creative musical work in different media of expression.

Thus, the creative vocal attitudes that children from an early age work on naturally when they make up songs spontaneously, facilitate a vocal, musical and communicative interaction that links creative ability in the development of musical creative thinking and activity (Barrett, 2006). Stimulating this skill in the school environment provides an opportunity to extend the vocal cognitive-expressive dimension that enhances the development of vocal attitudes through creative practice. The same happens with bodily and instrumental skills which, thanks to creative practice, promote bodily and instrumental knowledge and an improvement in the understanding and expression of musical elements (Peñalver, 2013). Although it is the teacher who is ultimately responsible for the methodology of teaching musical creativity in the classroom, the specific curriculum of each autonomous region sets a reference for the interpretation and orientation of its didactics. If creativity is also shared between different arts, it implies a combination of various performative elements such as music, dance, theatre, literature or mixed media in which corporeality, presence and actions in their different manifestations are part of the interpretative concept and product, providing a more complete expressive dimension (Hubrich, 2016). Thus, it can be said that the development of creativity is fostered by interdisciplinarity and the combination of resources (Burnard & Murphy, 2017; Odena, 2001) in a didactic environment of innovation and entrepreneurship, motivation for action, exercise of freedom and development of the students' personality (Azqueta & Naval, 2019).

5. Conclusions

Based on the above, it is concluded that all the objectives have been met. With regard to the first objective: -to study the educational approach that identifies creativity in the Primary School music curriculum-, it is concluded that the legal provisions consulted take creativity into account as a pedagogical necessity of the entire educational system, and musical creativity as that cognitive, artistic, expressive and cultural capacity that collaborates in the development of creative thinking (Van Broekhoven *et al.*, 2020; Zhou, 2021). Going deeper into the resolution of the stated aims, the comparative analysis of the regional curricula favours the understanding of the unequal treatment of musical creativity, as an artistic, productive and emancipatory capacity, whose differences condition its interpretation, and of the expressive, creative, cultural and philosophical approach of its didactics.

With regard to the second objective, to analyse creativity as an objective of study and its evaluation according to the different creative modalities, it is concluded that the curricular purpose of musical creativity is aimed at stimulating the education of a productive attitude in students and the discovery of new ways of accessing and constructing musical knowledge from the elaboration of arrangements, improvisation and composition as creative modalities from which to respond to the demands imposed by society on education. The documentary analysis reveals that, for this to become a reality, it is necessary to influence both the adjustment of the objectives and the assessment criteria that assess the learning that students must acquire in creativity at the end of the stage. The planning of objectives requires an orientation of the education and development of the students' attitude of initiative and confidence in their musical capacity for production (Coulson & Burke, 2013) from ideation, action and reflection as strategies that should form part of a pedagogy of innovation and entrepreneurship (Azqueta & Naval, 2019; Ruíz-Herrero, 2013). The analysis of the learning obtained in musical creativity makes it necessary to pay attention to the assessment criteria of creative skills. A periodic formative formative evaluation method of analysing the progress of students' creative skills is suggested as a way of adjusting teaching practice and contributing to the development of critical thinking, self-confidence and autonomy in learning. In this sense, the field of research requires an increase in studies on the assessment of musical creativity and how it affects educational practice (Ho & Bautista, 2022; Odena, 2005).

With regard to the third objective, to examine in a contrasted manner the methodological orientations that include the application of creativity in musical learning in the different regional curricula, it is concluded that the study of artistic creativity in the curriculum requires a methodological specification that facilitates the orientation of its didactics. The absence of a section on methodological guidelines in more than a third of the Spanish regional curricula limits the knowledge of the didactics of musical creativity, of its artistic and expressive possibilities. The creative methodological orientations found in the curricula refer to techniques (active methodologies), strategies (learning by discovery, cooperative learning, global projects, interdisciplinary relations, use of codes of representation of music) and didactic supports (the use of technologies), whose approach can favour the education of creativity if it takes place in creative teaching contexts. The educational possibility of creativity to stimulate and expand the musical learning capacity of students with the development of skills and attitudes of confidence, imagination, curiosity and inventiveness (Burnard & Murphy, 2017) requires a curricular methodological orientation of didactic reference, which helps teachers to plan and implement music teaching experiences in a creative way.

Therefore, analysing the treatment of musical creativity in the Primary Education curriculum of the Spanish educational system as a basis for didactic guidance and contribution to creativity education as a transversal competence -the main objective of this work- shows that although creativity is established in the curriculum and the school environment is postulated as an ideal context for the development of musical creative thinking, the barriers to fostering it are related to the limitations of time in the classroom and to the fact that creativity is directly associated with the arts (Lage *et al.*, 2022), as well as the lack of preparation of some teachers in this area (Odena, 2001). The present study reflects, therefore, that creativity is transversal and primordial to all the disciplines established in the official teaching curriculum, although the researchers underline the fact that despite its reflection in the legal regulations, it is the teachers who must carry out this teaching challenge through a creative teaching process, with a

methodology for action that supports creative pedagogy in all subjects and with the corresponding evaluation that endorses its contribution to the educational development of the students (Stabback, 2016). The regional regulations lack common basic foundations for the curricular treatment of creativity that would facilitate its understanding and didactic orientation.

Its integration into the education system requires an articulation of the curricular elements to ensure methodological and evaluative coherence of this transversal competence and a metacognitive and functional interpretation of its teaching, the direct impact of which has a significant impact on the learner's exit profile at the end of basic education.

Note: this text is an automatic translation from Spanish to English. Some errors may have crept into this translation. We apologise for this.

References

- Abramo, J.J. & Reynolds, A. (2015). "Pedagogical Creativity" as a framework for music teacher education. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 25(1), 37-51. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1057083714543744>
- Alhothali, H.M. (2021). Inclusion of 21st Century Skills in Teacher Preparation Programs in the Light of Global Expertise. *International Journal of Education and Practice*, 9(1), 105-127. <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-7396-8501>
- Alsina, M. (2006). Competencias profesionales y creatividad docente en los futuros profesores de música de Secundaria: un estudio a partir del contexto universitario inglés. *RECIEM*, 3(2), 1-16. <https://revistas.ucm.es/index.php/RECI/article/view/RECI0606110002A>
- Amabile, T.M. (1997). Motivating creativity in organizations: On doing what you love and loving what you do. *California Management Review*, 40(1), 39-58. <https://doi.org/10.2307/41165921>
- Angel-Alvarado, R. (2018). Controversias entre la teoría curricular y la práctica educativa en la Educación Musical. *Revista Electrónica Complutense de Investigación en Educación Musical*, 15, 83-9. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5209/RECIEM.58530>
- Arias, F.G. (2012). *El proyecto de investigación. Introducción a la metodología científica*. Editorial Episteme.
- Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporty Authority (ACARA) (2021). Australian Curriculum, Assessment and Reporty Authority. *The Arts* (Version 8.4.). Music. <https://www.australiancurriculum.edu.au/f-10-curriculum/the-arts/music/>
- Ausubel, D.P. (1963). *The psychology of meaningful verbal learning*. Grune and Stratton.
- Azqueta, A. & Naval, C. (2019). Educación para el emprendimiento: una propuesta para el desarrollo humano. *Revista Española de Pedagogía*, 77(274), 517-533. <https://doi.org/10.22550/REP77-3-2019-03>

- Barrett, M.S. (2006). Inventing songs, inventing worlds. The “genesys” of creative thought and activity in young children’s lives. *International Journal of Early Years Education*, 14(3), 201-220. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669760600879920>
- Baskale, H. (2016). Determination of validity, reliability and sample size in qualitative studies. *Dokuz Eylul University E-Journal of Nursing Faculty*, 9(1), 23-28. <https://www.researchgate.net/deref/>
- Beghetto, R.A. & Kaufman, J.C. (2017). Creativity in teaching. In: *The Cambridge handbook of creativity across domains* (pp.549-564). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/9781316274385.030>
- Berbel, N., Murillo, A. & Riaño, M.E. (2020). Cuando el barrio educa: aprendizaje situado y creación artística colaborativa como herramienta en la formación musical del futuro docente. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 46, 68-91. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.46.17764>
- Blanco, Y. & Peñalba, A. (2020). La formación de futuros docentes de música en las universidades de Castilla y León: creatividad, ciudadanía y aprendizaje como claves del cambio educativo. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 46, 166-186. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.46.17756>
- Bouij, C. (2004). Two theoretical perspectives on the socialization of music teachers. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, 3(3), 1-14. <http://act.maydaygroup.org>
- Boyatzis, R.E. (1998). *Transforming qualitative information: Thematic analysis and code development*. Sage Publications.
- Burnard, P. (2012). *Musical Creativities in Practice*. Oxford University Press.
- Burnard, P. & Murphy, R. (2017). *Enseñar música de forma creativa*. Morata.
- Bylica, K. & Bauman, B. (2022). Teaching in a time of crisis. Pedagogical creativity in Music Education. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, 231, 7-24. <https://doi.org/10.5406/21627223.231.01>
- Caballero, M., Manso J., Matarranz, M. & Valle, J. (2016) Investigación en Educación Comparada: Pistas para investigadores noveles. *Revista Latinoamericana de Educación Comparada*. <http://www.saece.com.ar/relec/numero9.php>
- Cinque, M. (2016). “Lost in translation”. Soft skills development in European countries. *Tuning Journal for Higher Education*, 3(2), 389-427. [https://doi.org/10.18543/tjhe-3\(2\)-2016pp389-427](https://doi.org/10.18543/tjhe-3(2)-2016pp389-427)
- Conselleria de Educación, Cultura y Deporte (2014). *Decret 108/2014, de 4 de juliol, del Consell, pel qual establix el currículum i desplega l’ordenació general de l’Educació Primària a la Comunitat Valenciana*. DOGV (07/07/2014), núm.7311, pp.16325-16694. https://dogv.gva.es/datos/2014/07/07/pdf/2014_6347.pdf

- Corbisiero-Drakos, L., Reeder, L.K., Ricciardi, L., Zacharia, J. & Harnett, S. (2021). Arts Integration and 21st Century Skills: A Study of Learners and Teachers. *International Journal of Education & the Arts*, 22(2), 1-25. <https://doi.org/10.26209/ijea22n2>
- Coulson, A.N. & Burke, B.M. (2013). Creativity in the elementary music classroom: A study of students' perceptions. *International Journal of Music Education*, 31(4), 428-441. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761413495760>
- Csikszentmihalyi, M. (1998). *Creatividad el flujo y la psicología del descubrimiento y la invención*. Paidós.
- Delalande, F. (2013). *Las conductas musicales*. Editorial de la Universidad de Cantabria.
- Del Barrio-Aranda, L. (2012). *La creación musical: una propuesta educativa basada en el análisis y desarrollo del conocimiento musical en la etapa de Educación Primaria*. [Tesis doctoral. Universidad de Barcelona]. <http://hdl.handle.net/10803/130797>
- Department for Education (2014). *The National curriculum in England- Framework document*. <https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/>
- Esquivias, M.T. (1997). Estudio evaluativo de tres aproximaciones pedagógicas: ecléctica, Montessori y Freinet, sobre la ejecución de problemas y creatividad, con niños de escuela primaria. [Tesis de Licenciatura en Psicología]. Facultad de Psicología, UNAM.
- Fautley, M. (2010). *Assessment in music education*. Oxford University Press.
- Fereday, J. & Muir-Cochrane, E. (2006). Demonstrating rigour using thematic analysis: A hybrid approach of inductive and deductive coding and theme development. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 5(1), 80-92. <https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690600500107>
- Fernández, A. & Jorquera, M.C. (2017). El sentido de la educación musical en una educación concebida como motor de la economía del conocimiento: una propuesta de marco filosófico. *Revista Electrónica Complutense de Investigación en Educación Musical*, 14, 95-107. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5209/RECIEM.54834>
- Finnish National Agency for Education (2021). *National Core Curriculum for Basic Education, 2014*. <https://verkkokauppa.oph.fi/EN/page/product/national>
- Gallardo, A., Ortega, R., Vega, E. & Gómez, O. (2015). Validación de dos instrumentos de medida para evaluar las creencias motivacionales y las estrategias de práctica en los procesos de memorización en la interpretación pianística. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 36, 31-48. <https://ojs.uv.es/index.php/LEEME/article/view/9872/9291>
- Galton, F. (1869). *Hereditary Genius*. Macmillan & Co.
- García-Gil, D., Cuervo-Calvo, L. & Bonastre, C. (2022). A Critical Reflection on Virtual Music Education in a Changing World. *The International Journal of Humanities Education*, 20(2), 43-61. <http://doi.org/10.18848/1447-9508/CGP>

- Generalidad de Cataluña (2015). *Decret 119/2015, de 23 de juny, d'ordenació dels ensenyaments de l'educació primària*. DOGC (26/06/2015), núm.6900, pp.1-136. <http://xtec.gencat.cat/>
- Gimeno, J. (Ed.). (2010). *Saberes e incertidumbres sobre el currículum*. Ediciones Morata.
- Glăveanu, V.P. (2018). Creativity in and for Society. *Sciendo*, 5(2), 155-158. <https://doi.org/10.1515/ctra-2018-0012>
- Gobierno de Aragón (2014). *Orden de 16 de junio de 2014, de la Consejera de Educación, Universidad, Cultura y Deporte, por la que se aprueba el currículo de la Educación Primaria y se autoriza su aplicación en los centros docentes de la Comunidad Autónoma de Aragón*. BOA (20/06/2014), núm.119, pp.199288-20246. <https://educa.aragon.es/>
- Gobierno de Canarias (2014). *Decreto 89/2014, de 1 de agosto, por el que se establece la ordenación y el currículo de la Educación Primaria en la Comunidad Autónoma de Canarias*. BOC (13/08/2014), núm.156, pp.21911-22582. <http://www.gobiernodecanarias.org>
- Gobierno de Cantabria (2014). *Decreto 27/2014, de 5 de junio, que establece el currículo de Educación Primaria en la Comunidad Autónoma de Cantabria*. BOC (13/06/2014), núm.29, pp.1-431. <https://boc.cantabria.es/boces>
- Gobierno de Castilla-La Mancha (2014). *Decreto 54/2014, de 10/07/2014, por el que se establece el currículo de la Educación Primaria en la Comunidad Autónoma de Castilla-La Mancha*. DOCM (11/07/2014), núm.132, pp.18498-18909. <https://www.educa.jccm.es/>
- Gobierno de España (2014). *Real Decreto 126/2014, de 28 de febrero, por el que se establece el currículo básico de Educación Primaria*. BOE (01/03/2014), núm.52, referencia 2222, pp.19349-19420. <https://www.boe.es/boe/dias/2014/03/01/pdfs/BOE-A-2014-2222.pdf>
- Gobierno de España (2020). *Ley Orgánica 3/2020, de 29 de diciembre, por la que se modifica la Ley Orgánica 2/2006, de 3 de mayo, de Educación*. BOE (30/12/2020), núm.340, referencia 17264, pp.122868-122952. <https://www.boe.es/boe/dias/2020/12/30>
- Gobierno de España (2021). *Real Decreto 984/2021, de 16 de noviembre, por el que se regulan la evaluación y la promoción en la Educación Primaria, así como la evaluación, la promoción y la titulación en la Educación Secundaria Obligatoria, el Bachillerato y la Formación Profesional*. BOE (17/11/2021), núm.275, referencia 18812, pp.141583-141595. <https://www.boe.es/boe/dias/2021/11/17/pdfs/BOE-A-2021-18812.pdf>
- Gobierno de España (2022). *Real Decreto 157/2022, de 1 de marzo, por el que se establecen la ordenación y las enseñanzas mínimas de Educación Primaria*. BOE (02/03/2022), núm.52, referencia 3296, pp.24386-24504. <https://www.boe.es/eli/es/rd/>
- Gobierno de Islas Baleares (2014). *Decreto 32/2014 de 18 de julio, por el que se establece el currículo de la educación primaria en las Illes Balears*. BOIB (19/09/2014), núm. 97, pp.33178-33332. <https://www.caib.es/sites/transparenciaperconselleria>
- Gobierno de la Comunidad de Madrid (2014). *Decreto 89/2014, de 24 de julio, del Consejo de Gobierno, por el que se establece para la Comunidad de Madrid el Currículo de la*

- Educación Primaria*. BOCM (25/07/2014), núm.175, pp.1-116. https://www.bocm.es/boletin/CM_Orden_BOCM/2014/07/25/BOCM-20140725-1.PDF
- Gobierno de la Región de Murcia (2014). *Decreto n.º 198/2014, de 5 de septiembre, por el que se establece el currículo de la Educación Primaria en la Comunidad Autónoma de la Región de Murcia*. BORM (06/09/2014), núm.206, pp.33054-33556. <https://www.borm.es/services/anuncio/ano/2014/numero/11264/pdf?id=713895>
- Gobierno de La Rioja (2014). *Decreto 24/2014, de 13 de junio, por el que se establece el currículo de la Educación Primaria en la Comunidad Autónoma de La Rioja*. BOR (16/06/2014), núm.74, pp.1-403. <https://web.larioja.org/normativa?n=1973>
- Gobierno de Navarra (2014). *Decreto Foral 60/2014, de 16 de julio, por el que se establece el currículo de las enseñanzas de Educación primaria en la Comunidad Foral de Navarra*. BON (05/09/2014), núm.174, pp.1-181. <https://bon.navarra.es/es/anuncio/>
- Gobierno de Principado de Asturias (2014). *Decreto 82/2014, de 28 de agosto, por el que se regula la ordenación y establece el currículo de la Educación Primaria en el Principado de Asturias*. BOPA (30/08/2014), núm.202, pp.1-414. <https://sede.asturias.es/bopa/2014>
- Gobierno Vasco (2016). *Decreto 236/2015, de 22 de diciembre, por el que se establece el currículo de Educación Básica y se implanta en la Comunidad Autónoma del País Vasco*. BOPV (15/01/2016), núm.9, referencia 141, pp.1-279. <https://www.legegunea.euskadi.eus>
- Guest, G., MacQueen, K.M. & Namey, E.E. (2012). *Applied thematic analysis*. Sage Publications.
- Guilford, J.P. (1950). Creativity. *The American Psychologist*, 5(9), 444-454. <https://doi.org/10.1037/h0063487>
- Hallam, S. (2010). The power of music: Its impact on the intellectual, social and personal development of children and young people. *International Journal of Music Education*, 28(3), 269-289. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761410370658>
- Haning, M. (2020). Identity formation in music teacher education: The role of the curriculum. *International Journal of Music Education*, 39(2), 1-11. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761420952215>
- Hart, J.T. (2019). The status of music education conducting curricula, practices, and values. *Journal of Music Teacher Education*, 28(2), 13-27. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1057083718783464>
- Ho, Y.L. & Bautista, A. (2022). Music activities in Hong Kong kindergartens: A content analysis of the Quality Review reports. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 49, 32-49. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.49.24249>
- Hubrich, S.G.B. (2016). The performer's body in creative interpretations of repertoire music. *Arts and Humanities in Higher Education*, 15(3-4), 337-352. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1474022216647711>

- Junta de Andalucía (2015). *Decreto 97/2015, de 3 de marzo, por el que se establece la ordenación y el currículo de la Educación Primaria en la Comunidad Autónoma de Andalucía*. BOJA (13/03/2015), núm. 50, pp. 11-22. <https://www.juntadeandalucia.es/boja/2015/50/1>
- Junta de Castilla y León (2016). *Decreto 26/2016, de 21 de julio, por el que se establece el currículo y se regula la implantación, evaluación y desarrollo de la Educación Primaria en la Comunidad de Castilla y León*. BOCYL (25/07/2016), núm. 142, pp. 34184-34746. <https://www.educa.jcyl.es/es/resumenbocyl/decreto-26-2016-21-julio-establece-curriculo-regula-implant>
- Junta de Extremadura (2014). *Decreto 103/2014, de 10 de junio, por el que se establece el currículo de Educación Primaria para la Comunidad Autónoma de Extremadura*. DOE (16/06/2014), núm.114, pp.18965-19283. <http://doe.juntaex.es/pdfs/doe/2014/>
- Kaplan, D. (2019) Creativity in Education: Teaching for Creativity Development. *Psychology*, 10, 140-147. <https://doi.org/10.4236/psych.2019.102012>
- Lage, C., Centeno, J.L. & Cremades, R. (2022). Creatividad participativa en la composición de bandas sonoras en Educación Secundaria. *LEEME*, 49, 50-66. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.49.24080>
- Leong, S. & Qiu, X.L. (2013). Designing a creativity and assessment scale for arts education. *Educational Psychology: An International Journal of Experimental Educational Psychology*, 33(5), 596-615. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01443410.2013.827154>
- Marín, R. & De la Torre S. (1991). *Manual de la creatividad*. Vicens Vives.
- Martínez, Y., Ivanova, A. & Martínez, C. (2019). La creación en la enseñanza musical de la Comunidad de Madrid: estudio curricular comparativo. *Revista Electrónica de LEEME*, 43, 74-92. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.43.14016>
- Martinović Bogojević, J. & Rotar Pance, B. (2022). Musical creativity in the teaching practice in Montenegrin and Slovenian primary schools. *British Journal of Music Education*, 39(2), 169-182. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0265051722000018>
- Merchán, J., Ramos, S. & Montoya, J.C. (2022). Ecosistemas educativos para la práctica musical en el entorno de la Web Social: una revisión sistemática de literatura. *Revista de Investigación Educativa*, 40(2), 565-587. <http://dx.doi.org/10.6018/rie.477721>
- Mincer, J. (1974). *Schooling, Experience and Earnings*. National.
- Mitjás, M.A. (1995). *Creatividad Personalidad y Educación*. Editorial Pueblo y Educación.
- National Association for Music Education (2014). *2014 Music Standards (PK-8 General Music)*. National Association for Music Education (NAFME). <https://nafme.org/wp>
- National Association for Music Education (2017). *Grade strand 3-5: Knowledge and Skills*. Reston: National Association for Music Education (NAFME). <https://nafme.org/my-classroom/standards/>

- National Coalition for Core Arts Standards (2014). *National Core Arts Standards: A Conceptual Framework for Arts Learning*. Dover: State Education Agency Directors of Arts Education (SEADAE). <https://www.nationalartsstandards.org/sites/default/files>
- OCDE (2019). *El trabajo de la OCDE sobre Educación y Competencias*. OCDE. <https://www.oecd.org/education/>
- Odena, O. (2001) Developing a framework for the study of teachers' views of creativity in music education. *Goldsmiths Journal of Education*, 4, 59-67. <http://eprints.gla.ac.uk/>
- Odena, O. (2005). Un estudio sobre creatividad musical en escuelas de Secundaria de Inglaterra. *Música y Educación, Revista trimestral de Pedagogía Musical*, 18(63), 99-108. <https://eprints.gla.ac.uk/76410/>
- Odena, O. & Welch, G. (2009). A generative model of teachers' thinking on musical creativity. *Psychology of Music*, 37(4), 416-442. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0305735608100374>
- Oliver-Barcelo, M., Ferrer-Ribot, M. & Pinya, C. (2022). Creativity in Ibero-American Early Childhood Education Curricula. *Creativity*, 9(1), 1-25. <https://sciendo.com/pdf/>
- Peñalver, J.M. (2013). Formación rítmica: los ritmos aditivos y su aplicación pedagógica en la educación musical. *LEEME*, 32, 92-120. <https://ojs.uv.es/index.php/LEEME/article/>
- Rapley, T. (2014). *Los análisis de la conversación, del discurso y de documentos en Investigación Cualitativa*. Morata.
- Renzulli, J.S. & Reis, S.M. (2014). *The Schoolwide Enrichment Model: A how-to guide for talent development*. Prufrock Press.
- Roberts, J.W. (2011). *Beyond Learning by Doing: Theoretical Currents in Experiential Education*. Routledge.
- Rodríguez, J.E., Dalmau, J.M., Pérez-Aradros, B., Gargallo, E. & Rodríguez, G. (2014). *Educación para emprender. Guía didáctica de educación emprendedora en Primaria*. Universidad de La Rioja.
- Rodríguez-Quiles, J.A. (2021). Educación musical, epistemocracia y postcovid-19. *LEEME*, 47, 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.47.17550>
- Ruiz-Herrero, J.A. (Julio, 2013). *Nuevos espacios productivos en el capitalismo cognitivo: el ejemplo del emprendimiento* [Presentación de *Paper*]. XI Congreso Español de Sociología. Simposio llevado a cabo en la Conferencia de la Federación Española de Sociología, Madrid, España. <https://scholar.google.es/citations>
- Saetre, J.H. (2011). Teaching and learning music composition in primary school settings. *Music Education Research*, 13(1), 29-50 <https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2011.553276>
- Sawyer, R.K. (2011). What makes good teachers great? The artful balance of structure and improvisation. En R.K. Sawyer (Ed.), *Structure and improvisation in creative teaching* (pp.1-2). Cambridge University Press.

- Sawyer, R.K. (2012). *Explaining creativity: the science of human innovation*. Oxford University Press.
- Sawyer, R.K. (2017). Teaching creativity in art and design studio classes: A systematic literature review. *Educational Research Review*, 22, 99-113. <http://keithsawyer.com/PDFs>
- Shuler, S.C. (2014). *Music National Standards Comparison: 1994 versus 2014*. http://www.nafme.org/wp-content/files/2014/11/StandardsComparison_REVISED2.pdf
- Stabback, P. (2016). Qué hace a un currículo de calidad. *Reflexiones en progreso N° 2 sobre cuestiones fundamentales y actuales del currículo y el aprendizaje*. Oficina Internacional de la Educación de la UNESCO.
- Sternberg, R. (1985). *Beyond I. Q. A triarchic theory of human intelligence*. Cambridge University Press.
- Tomlinson, C.A., Kaplan, S.N., Renzulli, J.S., Purcell, J.H., Leppien, J.H., Burns, D.E., Strickland, C.A. & Imbeau, M.B. (2009). *The parallel curriculum: A design to develop learner potential and challenge advanced learners*. Corwin Press.
- Torrance, E. (1976). *Educación y capacidad creativa*. Marova.
- Van Broekhoven, K., Cropley, D. & Seegers, P. (2020). Differences in creativity across Art and STEM students: We are more alike than unlike. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 38, 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2020.100707>
- Van Gelderen, M., Brand, M.J., van Praag, M. Bodewes, W., Poutsma, E. & Van Gils, A. (2008). Explaining Entrepreneurial Intentions by Means of the Theory of Planned Behavior. *Career Development International*, 13(6), 538-559. <https://doi.org/10.1108/13620430810901688>
- Ward, T.B. (2007). Creative cognition as a window on creativity. *Methods*, 42(1), 28-37. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ymeth.2006.12.002>
- Weng, X., Chiu, T. & Tsang, C. C. (2022). Promoting student creativity and entrepreneurship through real-world problem-based maker education. *Thinking-Skills and Creativity*, 45(1-2), 101046. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2022.101046>
- Wertheimer, M. (1959). *Productive thinking*. Harper.
- Wollschlager, G. (1976). *Creatividad, Sociedad y Educación*. Promoción Cultural.
- Xu, W. & Zammit, K. (2020). Applying Thematic Analysis to Education: A Hybrid Approach to Interpreting Data in Practitioner Research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 19(66). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406920918810>
- Xunta de Galicia (2014). *Decreto 105/2014, de 4 de septiembre, por el que se establece el currículo de la educación primaria en la Comunidad Autónoma de Galicia*. DOG (09/09/2014), núm.171, pp.37406-38087. <https://www.xunta.gal/dog/Publicados>

Yelo Cano, J.J. (2018). La recreación artística de textos e imágenes como modelo para el desarrollo de la creatividad y la integración de los lenguajes expresivos en el aula de Música. *LEEME*, 42, 84-98. <https://doi.org/10.7203/LEEME.42.13171>

Yi, X., Plucker, J. & Guo, J. (2015). Modeling Influences on Divergent Thinking and Artistic Creativity. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 16, 62-68. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2015.02.002>

Zhou, Z. (2021). The influence of choral practices and passive listening to music on creative thinking. *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 42, 100968. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tsc.2021.100972>